# Preliminary Analysis of Melt 

John Krieg

Professor of Economics

Director, Office of Survey Research

## Data

- All confirmed freshmen from 201440, 201540, and 201640 ( $\mathrm{N}=$ 7358).
- Melt is defined as freshmen who confirmed but failed to enroll in fall quarter classes.
- 789 instances of melt among 740 individuals (49 students melted in one year but then enrolled at WWU in a following year)
- 789 instances of melt represents $10.72 \%$ of confirmed freshmen.


## Some Preliminaries

- 79 confirmed freshmen have missing Als. Among these 79, 21 (26.6\%) melted. Because these have missing Al data, I drop these 79 from the rest of the analysis.
- Why is Al missing? What makes them melt at such a high rate?
- After removing these 79, there are 7,279 valid observations with 768 (10.55\%) of these that melted.


## A few observations

| melt | hispanic <br> No |  | Yes |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | Total

## A few observations

| melt | citizen |  |  |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
|  | Yes | Total |  |
| No | 156 <br> 79.59 | 6,355 | 6,511 |
|  | Yes | 49.72 | 89.45 |
| Total | 20.41 | 10.28 | 10.55 |
|  | 196 | 7,083 | 768 |
|  | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

## A few observations

| melt | honorsadmit <br> No |  | Yes |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | Total

## A few observations

| melt | campusvisit <br> No |  | Yes |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | Total

## A few observations

| melt | Washing Res No | State <br> Yes | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| No | 1,186 | 5,325 | 6,511 |
|  | 84.23 | 90.70 | 89.45 |
| Yes | 222 | 546 | 768 |
|  | 15.77 | 9.30 | 10.55 |
| Total | 1,408 | 5,871 | 7,279 |
|  | 100.00 | 100.00 | 100.00 |

## A few observations

| melt | Non-resident, non-scholarship |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Resident | Non-resid | Total |
| No | 6,300 | 269 | 6,569 |
|  | 95.91 | 4.09 | 100.00 |
| Yes | 657 | 132 | 789 |
|  | 83.27 | 16.73 | 100.00 |
| Total | 6,957 | 401 | 7,358 |
|  | 94.55 | 5.45 | 100.00 |

## A few observations

| melt | Relative of an Alumni <br> No |  | Yes |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | Total

## A few observations

| melt | Submitted FAFSA <br> Application <br> No |  | Yes |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | Total

## A few observations

| High School Region | melt |  | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | No | Yes |  |
| Alaska | 94 | 21 | 115 |
|  | 81.74 | 18.26 | 100.00 |
| Arizona | 20 | 4 | 24 |
|  | 83.33 | 16.67 | 100.00 |
| California North | 160 | 32 | 192 |
|  | 83.33 | 16.67 | 100.00 |
| California South | 166 | 21 | 187 |
|  | 88.77 | 11.23 | 100.00 |
| Central Washington | 268 | 35 | 303 |
|  | 88.45 | 11.55 | 100.00 |
| Colorado | 136 | 16 | 152 |
|  | 89.47 | 10.53 | 100.00 |
| Eastern Washington | 33 | 2 | 35 |
|  | 94.29 | 5.71 | 100.00 |
| Exceptions | 32 | 7 | 39 |
|  | 82.05 | 17.95 | 100.00 |
| Hawaii | 54 | 14 | 68 |
|  | 79.41 | 20.59 | 100.00 |
| Home School Washingto | 1 | 1 | 2 |
|  | 50.00 | 50.00 | 100.00 |
| Idaho | 73 | 8 | 81 |
|  | 90.12 | 9.88 | 100.00 |
| International | 17 | 4 | 21 |
|  | 80.95 | 19.05 | 100.00 |


| Island and San Juan | $\begin{array}{r} 117 \\ 95.90 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 5 \\ 4.10 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 122 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| King County East | $\begin{array}{r} 925 \\ 92.04 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 80 \\ 7.96 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 1,005 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| King County North | $\begin{array}{r} 506 \\ 87.69 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 71 \\ 12.31 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 577 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| King County South | $\begin{array}{r} 724 \\ 90.61 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 75 \\ 9.39 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 799 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Midwestern States | $\begin{array}{r} 92 \\ 84.40 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 17 \\ 15.60 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 109 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Military \& US Living | $\begin{array}{r} 19 \\ 79.17 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 5 \\ 20.83 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 24 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Montana | $\begin{array}{r} 49 \\ 83.05 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 10 \\ 16.95 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 59 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Nevada | $\begin{array}{r} 29 \\ 93.55 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 2 \\ 6.45 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 31 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| New Mexico | $\begin{array}{r} 23 \\ 85.19 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 4 \\ 14.81 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 27 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Northeastern States | $\begin{array}{r} 30 \\ 76.92 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 9 \\ 23.08 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 39 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Oregon | $\begin{array}{r} 144 \\ 87.27 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 21 \\ 12.73 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 165 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Pierce County East | $\begin{array}{r} 227 \\ 90.44 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 24 \\ 9.56 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 251 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |


| Pierce County West | $\begin{array}{r} 278 \\ 91.45 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 26 \\ 8.55 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 304 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Skagit County | $\begin{array}{r} 170 \\ 87.63 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 24 \\ 12.37 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 194 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Snohomish County | $\begin{array}{r} 668 \\ 92.65 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 53 \\ 7.35 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 721 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Southern States | $\begin{array}{r} 83 \\ 76.85 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 25 \\ 23.15 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 108 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Southwest Washington | $\begin{array}{r} 336 \\ 92.05 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 29 \\ 7.95 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 365 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Spokane County | $\begin{array}{r} 195 \\ 92.42 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 16 \\ 7.58 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 211 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| The Peninsula | $\begin{array}{r} 502 \\ 88.69 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 64 \\ 11.31 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 566 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| US Territories | $\begin{array}{r} 1 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 0 \\ 0.00 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 1 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Utah | $\begin{array}{r} 29 \\ 85.29 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 5 \\ 14.71 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 34 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Whatcom County | $\begin{array}{r} 258 \\ 90.21 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 28 \\ 9.79 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 286 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Wyoming | $\begin{array}{r} 9 \\ 56.25 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 7 \\ 43.75 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 16 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |

## A few observations

|  | melt |  |  |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| AI Band | No | Yes | Total |
| AI <= 10 | 19 | 1 | 20 |
|  | 95.00 | 5.00 | 100.00 |
| AI > 10 \& AI <=20 | 87 | 12 | 99 |
|  | 87.88 | 12.12 | 100.00 |
| AI > 20 \& AI <=30 | 452 | 60 | 512 |
| AI > 30 \& AI <=40 | 88.28 | 11.72 | 100.00 |
| AI > 40 \& AI <=50 | 88.04 | 11.96 | 100.00 |
| 1,193 | 151 | 1,344 |  |
|  | 88.76 | 11.24 | 100.00 |


| $A I>50$ \& $A I<=60$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1,399 \\ & 88.94 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 174 \\ 11.06 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 1,573 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\mathrm{AI}>60$ \& $\mathrm{AI}<=70$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1,119 \\ & 89.59 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 130 \\ 10.41 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 1,249 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| $\mathrm{AI}>70$ \& $\mathrm{AI}<=80$ | $\begin{array}{r} 798 \\ 90.48 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 84 \\ 9.52 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 882 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| $\mathrm{AI}>80$ \& $\mathrm{AI}<=90$ | $\begin{array}{r} 442 \\ 94.65 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 25 \\ 5.35 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 467 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| AI > 90 | $\begin{array}{r} 52 \\ 96.30 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 2 \\ 3.70 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 54 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |
| Total | $\begin{aligned} & 6,511 \\ & 89.45 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 768 \\ 10.55 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 7,279 \\ 100.00 \end{array}$ |

## What is a logit?

- A method of using many, correlated variables to explain a binary (yes/no) outcome.
- Big benefit-it allows us to isolate the impact of a single variable even when that variable is correlated with other variables.
- For instance, Al might be connected to melt, but AI also is connected to scholarship dollars given to students. Logits allow us to separate the effects of AI from scholarships on melt.


## Interpreting Logits

- Two types of interpretation: when the explanatory variable is continuous or when it is binary.
- Continuous Variable Example:

The explanatory variable-this is one of many that explains melt.
-. 0184 is the "marginal effect" which explains the change in the probability of melt as the explanatory variable increases by 1 . In this case, a 1 thousand \$ increase in scholarship reduces the probably of melt by $.018 * 100=-1.84$ percentage points.
mfx dydx
WWU Scholarship (\$1000s)
-0.0184***
(0.00199)

This is the standard error which is a measure of precisely the marginal effect is measured. The smaller the se, the more precisely measured. $\mathrm{A} \pm 2$ se gives about a $95 \%$ confidence interval.

Asterisks represent statistical significance at the *** (1\%), ** (5\%), or * (10\%) level

## Interpreting Logits

## - Binary variable example

Explanatory variable that takes on a yes/no characteristic.

This coefficient tells the impact on melt of going from "no" to "yes" in the explanatory variable. In this case, male students are 100*-. $0133=-1.3 \%$ more likely to "melt" than "female" students.


## Logit results (continuous variables)

| VARIABLES | $m f x$ dydx | 10 point increase in Al raises probability of melt by 1.6 percentage points |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| AI | 0.00161*** |  |
|  | (0.000273) |  |
| Age | 0.00374 |  |
|  | (0.00433) |  |
| HS Distance (100s of mi) | 0.000473 | A $\$ 1000$ scholarship reduces the probability of melt by 2 percentage points |
|  | (0.000429) |  |
| WWU Scholarship (\$1000s) | $-0.0201^{* * *}$ |  |
|  | (0.00273) |  |
| Days to Quarter | -0.000175*** | An application arriving 100 days earlier than another reduces melt by 1.75 percentage points |
|  |  |  |

## Logit results (binary variables)

| VARIABLES | $m f x d y d x$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| black | 0.0123 | Relative to whites, Hispanics are 4 percentage points more likely to melt |
|  | (0.0170) |  |
| hispanic | 0.0400*** |  |
|  | (0.0131) |  |
| asian | 0.00883 |  |
|  | (0.00925) |  |
| indian | 0.00639 |  |
|  | (0.0185) |  |
| other | -0.0478*** |  |
|  | (0.0148) |  |
| male | -0.0145** |  |
|  | (0.00584) | 1.4\% percentage points less likely to melt |

## Logit results (binary variables, continued)

| VARIABLES | $m f x d y d x$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| First Generation | $0.00440$ | Relative to non-citizens, citizens are 6.7 percentage points less likely to melt |
|  | (0.00669) |  |
| Citizen | -0.0668*** |  |
|  | (0.0251) |  |
| WA Resident | $-0.138^{* * *}$ | WA residents are 13.8 percentage points less likely to melt than non-residents |
|  | (0.0311) |  |
| Relative of an Alumni | -0.0195*** |  |
|  | (0.00645) |  |
| Prior Visit to WWU Campus | $-0.0515^{* * *}$ | Relative to those never having visited WWU, those who have are less likely to melt by 5.1 percentage points |
|  | (0.00701) |  |

## Logit results (binary variables, continued)



## A digression

## Logit results (binary variables, continued)

- Neither Pell eligibility nor level of EFC matter;
- When include the region variables along with binary Washington resident, none of the region variables matter;
- Interaction with Hispanic and Distance don't matter;
- Honors (both applied, accepted, and denied) don't matter
- Prior attendees of college are less likely to melt (usually 3 to 5 percentage points depending on type of college)
- Conditional melt is about 2 percentage points higher in 2016 than in either 2014 or 2015.


## Ex Post Forecast

| melt | Model Predicted to <br> Melt <br> No | Yes | Total |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| No | 1,885 | 298 | 2,183 |
| Yes | 126 | 155 | 281 |

## What Happens to Melted Students?

- Matched Melted Students to National Student Clearinghouse Data (NSC)
- NSC claims to match $98 \%$ of students in public and private 2 - and 4 year institutions
- Of the 789 melted students, 388 (49.1\%) enrolled in a school covered by the NSC
- Of these 388 , 287 ( $73.9 \%$ ) enrolled in a 4-year school


## What Happens to College-Bound Melted Students?

| College | \# | \% | College | \# | \% |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| University Of Washington | 75 | 19.33 | Everett Community College | 9 | 2.32 |
| Western Washington University | 33 | 8.51 | Pierce College | 8 | 2.06 |
| Whatcom Community College | 13 | 3.35 | Skagit Valley College | 8 | 2.06 |
| Bellevue College | 12 | 3.09 | The Evergreen State College | 8 | 2.06 |
| Washington State University | 11 | 2.84 | Portland Community College | 7 | 1.8 |

